IAEA FUSION ENERGY CONFERENCE

THEORY SUMMARY (S/1-3)

J W Connor Culham Science Centre, UK

INTRODUCTION

Key Questions for Fusion Power

- **Confinement:** scalings, improved confinement (transport barriers)
- **Stability**: pressure limits, loss of control (disruptions), fast particle MHD
- **Exhaust:** divertor heat loads, ELM transients
- **Steady State**: simultaneous achievement of plasma performance, exhaust and current drive

Plus Basic Understanding: provides scientific underpinning

Review **Progress** from **Theory** against these objectives

STATISTICS

91 papers: 1 Overview (**new**) - Diamond: *Zonal flows in plasma turbulence*; 32 Oral (11 rapporteured), 58 Posters

Configurations: Mainly tokamaks (9 ITER, 8 STs) - 10 non-axisymmetric, 2 other alternates

Topics:

- Confinement 48 (ZFs 19, barriers 15)
- Stability 30 (NTMs 6, RWMs 4, ballooning modes 6, disruptions 4, fast particle MHD 10)
- H&CD, fuelling 7 (ICRH/LH 3, ECRH 3, pellet 1)
- Exhaust 14 (ELMs 7)

THEMES AND METHODOLOGIES

- Increasingly **sophisticated physics** and **geometric realism**
- Moves to Integrated Modelling
- Analytic interpretation of 'Numerical Experiments'

Numerical approaches vastly dominate:

- Turbulence simulations 21 (Edge/SOL 9)
- Transport codes 12
- Non-linear MHD 10 (hybrid fast particle codes 4)
- Fokker-Planck/Monte Carlo 10

PROGRESS (1): CONFINEMENT

BASIC UNDERSTANDING

- Zonal flows and turbulence: Overview (Diamond)
- ZFs have fast radial variation but azimuthally symmetric
- Ubiquitous and robustly generated in drift-wave turbulence
- Critical players in regulating non-linear dynamics ('predatorprey', 'burstiness') of turbulence: the **drift-wave/ZF paradigm**
- Reduce drift wave energy and transport

 $\chi \sim R\chi_{GB};$ $R = \gamma_{ZF}^{DAMP} / \omega << 1$ \Rightarrow **Cost** of power plant $\propto R^{-0.8}$

- $\gamma_{ZF}^{\text{DAMP}} \propto \nu_{ii} f(q) \Rightarrow \text{control}$ (also Falchetto TH-1/3Rd)
- Also critical gradient increases (Dimits-upshift)
- Can have **collisionless** damping of ZFs; eg via **tertiary** instabilities, say Kelvin-Helmholtz

Seen in expt - CHS (A Fujisawa et al, PRL 95 (2004) 165002)

- Unification of many physical situations in terms of two parameters: K and S (Kubo number, Drift wave stochasticity parameter)
- Zonal **fields** current corrugations: impact on RWMs, NTMs?
- Valuable **analysis** of 'what we know, what we think we know and what we don't understand'



TURBULENCE THEORY-CONTD

- Multiscale effects: ETG/ITG (Holland TH-P-6/5) Long wavelength drift-ITG straining suppresses ETG streamers, but the corresponding temperature perturbations increase ETG growth
- **Damped modes**: key role in TEM/ZF dynamics and saturation (Terry THP-6/9)
- Lagrangian formulation of Hasagawa-Mima turbulence and ZF eqns. (Dewar TH-P-6/1)

CORE TRANSPORT

Theme - increasing role for simulation codes: global codes, more complete physics and geometry, low magnetic shear

GYRO: Global code with full physics describes DIII-D ρ_* scaling in L-mode; feedback on profiles to achieve steady-state (Waltz TH-8/8)



GTC: allows **steep gradients** - turbulence **spreading** from edge to **stable core**, affecting ρ_{*} scaling (Hahm TH-1/4); analytic theory (Holland TH-P-6/5)

Nonlinear GTC Simulation

of Ion Temperature Gradient Turbulence

 $\frac{R}{L_{T}}$ = 5:3 at core (within Dimits shift regime)

 $\frac{R}{L_{T}}$ = 10:6 at edge:

Initial Growth at Edge and Local Saturation
→ Penetration into *stable* Core:
Lin,Hahm,Diamond,... PRL '02, PPCF '04

Saturation Level at Core:

$$\frac{e\delta\phi}{T_e} \sim 3.6 \frac{\rho_i}{a}$$

→ sometimes $\nabla \cdot \Gamma_{\text{spreading}} >> \gamma_{\text{local}}$ Can increase transport in unstable core, say fluctuations x2



ETG MODES

• Global code (GTC) shows streamers but $\chi_e \sim 3\chi_e^{ML} \Rightarrow$ need TEM; non-linear toroidal coupling essential for spectral cascade (Lin TH-8/4)



- Low s, low χ_e ; high s, streamers (Li TH-8/5Ra)
- Global code: near q_{min}, s < 0 ⇒ low χ_e
 s > 0 ⇒ streamers and large χ_e;
 role for toroidal mode coupling (Idomura TH-8/1)

IAEA2004 TH8-1 Y. Idomura et al. xe

χ_e gap structure in RS gap structure in RS-ETG turbulence

- RS-ETG turbulence shows qualitatively different structure formations across q_{min}
- **Zonal flows (streamers)** appear in negative (positive) shear region
- χ_e distribution has a **gap** structure across q_{min}







ELECTRON & ION TRANSPORT

TEM

- GS2 non-linear **upshift** on critical L_n^{-1} for C-Mod ITB; equilibrium with off-axis ICRH where Γ_{TEM} balances Ware drift
 - \Rightarrow on-axis ICRH gives **control**
 - GS2 fluctuations compare with PCI on expt (Ernst TH-4/1)

ITG

- Competition between **ZFs**, **GAMs** and **parallel flows**
 - \Rightarrow **q-dependent** χ_i (Miyato TH-8/5Ra, Hallatschek TH-P-6/3)
 - cf Hirose (TH-P-6/4)

ITG-CONTD

- **Benchmarking** turbulence characteristics in codes (Nevins TH-P-6/6)
 - GTC, GYRO: identify origin of discrepancies in χ_i , eg due to cross-phase
 - mixing length model fails

MISCELLANEOUS MODELS

FLUID

- ZF **upshift** of critical gradient (Falchetto TH-1/3Rd)
- flow generation due to L_n (Sarazin TH-P-6/7)
- reduced models (18 ODE's needed) and relaxation oscillations (Hamaguchi TH-8/3Ra)

KINETIC

• **entropy** balance accounting in **velocity** space: **fine-scale structures** and phase-mixing (Watanabe TH-8/3Rb)

'NEOCLASSICAL'

- **Sf codes:** GTC-Neo $\rho_{ban} \sim L_p \Rightarrow V_{\theta i}$ different from 'NC' depends on $\omega_{\phi}(\psi)$ (Hahm TH-1/4);
- Finite orbit width, non-axisymmetric geometry and E_r (Satake TH-P-2/18)
- **'Omniclassical'** in STs doubles χ_i^{NC} due to gyro-orbits (White/Goldston TH-P-2/19)
- Paleoclassical': Classical resistive diffusion ⇒ stochastic diffusion of field lines: captures many experimental features (Callen TH-1/1)

TOROIDAL MOMENTUM

Losses: (i) QL theory; (ii) non-resonant MHD and magnetic island effects.

Source: Identified toroidal 'travelling' modes along **B** for inward transport in **accretion** model (Shaing/Coppi TH-P-2/9)

TRANSPORT MODELLING

- Integrated modelling of advanced, steady state ST based on NSTX data $\Rightarrow \beta \le 40\%$ (Kessel TH-P-2/4)
- ITBs with mixed Bohm/gyroBohm model: need αstabilisation for DIII-D; real time q control simulation for JET (Tala TH-P-2/9)
- ETG transport modelling of **Tore Supra**, **NSTX** (Horton TH-P-3/5)
- Analysis of **ECRH switch on/off** in T10 ballistic response (Andreev TH-P-3/1)
- Calibration of the model for **barrier formation** in **CPTM**; simulations of MAST, DIII-D, JET, TFTR with similar fitting parameters; effective **critical** ρ_{*Te} values (after JET) similar (Dnestrovskij TH-P-6/55)
- **Integrated modelling** -TASK (Fukuyama TH-P-2/3)

NOVEL TRANSPORT MODELS

- Avalanches and non-diffusive transport observed in turbulence simulations represented in transport modelling by fractional derivatives (del-Castillo-Negrete TH-1/2)
- Model with critical gradients and Levy Flights captures density pinch, fast transients, power degradation (van Milligen TH-P-6/10)
- **Stationary Magnetic Entropy** model tested on JET and FTU: predicts q-profile in range of discharge types; less success with temperature profiles (Sozzi TH-P6-13)
- **Control** of test-particle transport in fusion relevant Hamiltonian systems (Chandre TH -PD-1)

EDGE TRANSPORT, PEDESTAL & BARRIER

• Relaxation model with flows and ballooning ∇p_{crit} (GuzdarTH-5/4)

 $\Rightarrow T_{ped} \propto n^{-1} \text{ and } \Delta_{ped} \propto n^{-3/2}$ - matches **JT-60U**; but drift waves robustly **unstable** in pedestal (GS2) (universal mode!)



- **Trans-collisional** gyrofluid code (**GEM**)
 - gradual change from edge drift waves to core ETG/ITG
 - drift wave/ZF system stable against bifurcation

New GK code developed:

-find similar results but more high k_{\perp} activity (Scott TH-7/1)

EDGE-CONTD

Computational models

• XGC: NC + neutrals +X-point n_{ped} develops in 10ms; $\Delta_{ped} \propto (T-T_c)^{1/2}/B_T;$ T pedestal broader (Chang TH-P-6/39)



• ASCOT: NC + E_r ; ELMFIRE (new 'f'-code): NC + E_r + turbulence; evidence for ITB formation in FT-2 simulation - (Kiviniemi TH-P-3/7)

Analytic & transport models

- poloidal and toroidal flows and neoclassical edge barrier (Fukuyama TH-P-2/3);
- coupled non -linear fluid model for V_{ϕ} , V_{θ} (Daybelge TH-P-4/2);
- improved modelling of impurity modes (Morozov TH-P-5/26);
- drift-Alfven transition model; role of L_n , $\Delta_{ped} \sim 1/n$ (Kalupin TH-P-3/6)

IMPROVED CORE CONFINEMENT, ITBs Current Hole (CH)

• Simulation of γ decay due to **redistribution** of α 's in the poloidal plane in JET: 2MA with CH ($\rho_{CH} \sim 0.4$) = 1MA in normal shear (Yavorskij TH-P-4/49)



• Formation of current hole by **vortex pair** in core (Tuda TH -P-2-10)





Profile Formation and Sustainment of Autonomous Tokamak Plasma with Current Hole Configuration -3 magnetic island model for CH (Hayashi, et al., TH-1/6)



Sharp reduction of anomalous transport in RS region (k~0) can reproduce JT-60U experiment.

Transport becomes neoclassical-level in RS region, which results in the autonomous formation of ITB and current hole through large bootstrap current.

1.5D transport simulation can reproduce JT-60U scalings.

ITB width determined by neoclassicallevel transport agrees with that in JT-60U : Δ_{ITB} ~1.5 $\rho_{pi,ITB}$.



Energy confinement inside ITB agrees with JT-60U scaling : $\epsilon_f \beta_{p,core} \sim 0.25$. Same value at MHD equilibrium limit in analytical model.



ITBs AT q_{min} , RI-MODE

- **Trigger** by DTM **magnetic island** (Dong TH-P-2/7)
- Stability at low shear and with flow shear

- **failure** of ballooning theory and complementary approach based on **'modelets'** (Connor TH-5/5)

- effects of s, $v_{\parallel}',\,v',\,\beta,\,j'\,$ in cylindrical stability calculations (Wang TH-P-6/11)

• **RI Mode**: trigger bifurcation by flows resulting from torques due to **poloidal radiation asymmetry**; stabilises at **lower impurity** concentration (Singh TH-P-5/31)

PROGRESS (2): STABILITY

Themes: Non-linear codes, realistic geometry with wall, improved fast particle models

NTM: (i) Triggers

- Forced reconnection by non-linear coupling to MHD modes
 frequency miss-match not a problem (Coehlo TH-P-5/2)
- Error field amplification (Pustovitov TH-P-6/3)

(ii) Critical island width w

- **Turbulent viscosity**:dominant stabilising effect on j_{BS} drive for island rotating in electron direction \Rightarrow not explanation of β_{Th} in expts; effect on j_{Pol} ? (Konovalov TH-P-5/10)
- **Rotation shear** destabilises, differential rotation stabilises (Sen TH-6/1)



Finite orbit (w ~ ρ_{ban}) effects on j_{bs} , j_{pol} (HAGIS): $j_{pol} \propto w$, w < ρ_{ban} ; j_{pol} changes **sign** near $\omega = \omega_{*e}$ (Poli TH-6/2)

TEARING MODES

- Non-linear enhancement of growth by drift wave turbulence (Yagi TH-P-5/17)
- Enhanced **reconnection** in collisional drift-tearing model parallel electron thermal conduction plays key role (Coppi TH-P2-29)
- Non-linear stabilisation of island at finite island width, w:

 $\Delta' \rightarrow \Delta' - c_1 w \ln (1/w) - c_2 w$ (Porcelli PD-1)

RWMs

Rotation stabilisation and **control:**





- stabilisation of n = 1 in **ITER** for $\omega_{\phi} \sim (1.5 3)\% \omega_{A}$;
- but predicted rotation < 2%
- \Rightarrow need **control**: possible to approach 80% of way between no-wall and ideal-wall limits (Liu TH-2/1)
- Effect of coupling to **stable** internal modes on external modes generate a 'peeling like' structure (Tokuda TH-P-4/46)
- Thick walls in ITER slow down growth rate (Strauss TH-2/2)

DISRUPTIONS

 Simulation of heat deposition due to disruption for DIII-D RS with NIMROD - asymmetric heat deposition from n =1 distortion (Kruger T-P-2/25)



- Modelling ITER halo current database with M32D -VDEs: halo current fraction ~ 0.35, toroidal peaking factor, TPF ~ 2 (Strauss TH-2/2)
- Self-consistent evolution of runaways and current in disruptions - central peaking of current - simulates JET; 1/2 of current in JET and 3/4 in ITER converted to runaways (Helander TH-P-4/39)



• **Eddy current** calculations in ETE ST (Ludwig TH-P-4/7)

PRESSURE LIMITS

- Non-axisymmetric studies of ideal MHD ballooning and interchange modes (Miura TH-2/3, Nakajima TH-5/6) and equilibrium & orbits (Suzuki TH-P-2/31), particularly LHD and for NCSX
 - reduced **disruptivity** from toroidal flow generation $\Rightarrow \beta \sim 1.5\%$ (Miura)
 - perturbative approach to identifying second stability (Hudson TH-P-2/24)

- 'realistic' treatment of boundary, reducing '**bumpiness**' improves stability and agreement with expt, $\beta \sim 3\%$ 'stable' - $\beta \sim 1\%$ more unstable (Nakajima)

 2-fluid non-linear modelling with M3D: better explains experiment; stabilises ideal and resistive modes ⇒ soft beta limit due to confinement degradation as islands grow large (Sugiyama TH-P-2/30)

- Rotation damping of ballooning modes
 - interpretation in terms of damping on **stable modes** (Furukawa TH-P-1/1);
 - **transition** from zero flow calculation of standard ballooning theory (Connor TH-5/5)

Instability suppression by sheared flows in dense **Z-pinch** (Herrera Velazquez TH-P-2/23)

FAST PARTICLE MHD

Themes: Realistic f_h, frequency-sweeping, diagnostic opportunities, alpha-losses

Fishbones & internal kink mode

- non-perturbative treatments of f_h , new branches
- Explain **low frequency** modes on JET with NOVA-K (Gorolenkov TH-P-5/2Rb)
- **Hybrid fishbones** and coalescence of fishbones during JET monster sawteeth, operating diagram in (γ_{MHD} , β_h , ω_{*i}) (Nabais TH-5/3)
- Non-conventional modes in ST (low **B**) and doublet frequency modes from passing particles in AUG (Kolesnichenko TH-P-4/42)

TAEs, EPMs

• Hybrid MHD-GK code: **Avalanching** transport of alphas, theory shows **threshold** near linear stability: τ_{loss} - few γ_{lin}^{-1} ; radial redistribution, loss only for **ITER RS** (Zonca TH-5/1)



• Non local EPM - width and location depends on energetic ion orbit width (Todo TH-3/1Ra)

Non-local Energetic Particle Mode

(Todo TH-3/1Ra)



The **radial width** of the non-local EPM significantly depends on the **orbit width** of the **energetic ions**. They are **induced** by the energetic ions.

Examples of the **spatial profile**. The toroidal mode number is n=1.



M3D Nonlinear hybrid simulations of **beam-driven modes** in NSTX shows a bursting n=2 TAE as the mode moves out **radially** (Fu TH-P-4/38).



t=0.0

t=336

- Frequency sweeping: slow sweep from equilibrium changes (Fu; Berk TH-P4/38); fast sweep from phase-space holes (Todo, Berk) ⇒ diagnostic for δb (Berk)
- $\gamma_{NBI} \sim \gamma_{Alpha}$ for n = 10 in **ITER**; $f_{Loss} \sim 5\%$ at 23keV (Berk)
- Alfven Cascades: , low frequency modes near q_{min} in JET (Berk); modes in cylinder due to ∇n (Konovalov TH-P-4/43)
- New modes in 2nd stability, MAST, NSTX (Berk)
- Self-consistent dynamics of f_h from ICRH and GAE with SELFO code ; captures experimentally observed amplitude oscillations (Hellsten TH-P-4/40)
- Thermal quench, T_e , from χ_e due to GAE + KAW islands in W7AS (Yakovenko TH-P-4/48)

PROGRESS (3): FUELLING, H&CD Themes: realistic physics / geometry, integrated modelling \Rightarrow major computation!

ICRH/LH: self-consistent energetic particle f_h , full wave

• **3D global** modelling for **LHD**; models phase space iso-surfaces

& satisfactory experimental comparisons for NDD-NPA **energy spectrum**

(Murakami TH-P-4/30)



- **FW**: alpha absorption in **ITER** tolerable, < 5%
- LH: model validated on C-Mod →
 TORIC full wave code shows diffraction sufficient to fill the spectral gap; damping at 2 -3 v_{the}

(Wright TH-P-4/35)



EC/EBW: relatavistic treatments, **suprathermal** tails (Nikolic TH-P-4/31, Ram TH-P-6/56)

• current drive in NSTX: $\eta_{CD} = 3.2$ at r/a = 0.5 (Okhawa); $\eta_{CD} = 1.9$ at r/a = 0.2 (Fisch-Boozer) (Ram)

EC wave transport

- relevant to **ITER** in **RS** with $T_e \sim 35$ keV (Dies TH-P-4/18)
- self-consistent modelling of effects of **suprathermal** tails and wave transport: not important for thermal plasma, but ECCD significant? (Kukushkin TH-P-6/56)

Low frequency and NBI: for FRC, RFP, Spheromaks (Farengo TH-P-4/20)

Theory and Experiments on DIII-D Compare Well



Vertical arrows indicate pellet burnout point.

• Fueling efficiency for inside launch is much better (even with slower pellets)

outside launch $\eta_{\text{theory}} = 66\%$, $\eta_{\text{exp}} = 46\%$ (discrepancy due to strong ELM)

 $\begin{array}{ll} \mbox{inside launch} & \eta_{theory} = 100\% \ , \ \eta_{exp} = 92\% & (\mbox{discrepancy due to weak} \\ \mbox{ELM}) & (\mbox{Parks TH-P-3/9}) \end{array}$

PROGRESS (4): EXHAUST

Themes : turbulence, integrated modelling, ELMs

SOL: turbulence simulations (Ghendrith TH-1/3Ra, Falchetto TH-1/3Rd, Ronglien TH-1/5)

- Coherent structures (blobs) with X-point: analytic modelling of 3-D blob dynamics; interpretation of BOUT results (D'Ippolito TH-P-6/2)
- **Integrated BOUT-UEDGE** codes (turbulence + neutrals+ Xpoint + transport) (Ronglien)

-increasing **density**: **transition** from resistive X-point modes to RBM & greatly increased transport (with blobs)

- predicts Greenwald density limit and X-point MARFES
- Tail of Γ_{wall} due to blobs

BOUT Simulations Show Strong Density Effects on Edge Turbulence

 A transition of boundary turbulence from resistive Xpoint to resistive ballooning once n > nG



 Identification of convective transport by localized plasma "blobs" in the SOL at the high density during neutral fueling



- ZFs suppressed in SOL due to connection to sheath (Falchetto)
- **Ballistic** density **front** propagation in 2D SOL turbulence

 $\Rightarrow \Delta_{SOL} \sim L_{\parallel}^{0.62} - agrees with analytic model$ -**ITER** $implication: <math>\Gamma_{wall}$ up just 10% on **diffusion** model (Ghendrith TH-1/3Ra)



Integrated Modelling: core - pedestal - SOL + ELMs (Pacher TH-P-3/25, Guzdar TH-5/5)

- Multi-mode model element extended to low shear and ETG (Guzdar)
- Detailed analysis/modelling of **Carbon** erosion in JET, **migration** and **asymmetric deposition**

- successful simulation by introducing **reflection** above some T_e^{crit} (~ 5 - 10 eV) at edge (Coster TH-P-5/18)

Modelled controlled suppression of ELMs by stochastic field transport due to I-coils in DIII-D without significant confinement degradation (Becoulet TH-1/3Rc)





- Non-linear ballooning mode evolution leads to explosive growth of filaments (Wilson TH-P-1/5)
 seen in MAST and BOUT simulation
- Simulate relaxation oscillations from RBM turbulence; result of transitory growth giving time delay before shear flow stabilisation (Benkadda TH-1/3Rb)